

“WE FOLLOW THE PRIVATE TUTORS NOT THE
TEACHERS”: AN ETHNOGRAPHIC INSIGHT INTO
EDUCATIONAL PRACTICES AMONG THE STUDENTS
OF AN INDIAN CITY

Paramita Sen*

ABSTRACT

Private tuition (PT), a way to supplement teaching provided by professionals, is a growing issue of discussion through countries. The present ethnography on the school students of an Indian city aims to explore and interpret the causes and consequences of popularization of PT that how it gradually is pervading in formal educational curriculum and seriously disrupting the emotion of higher secondary students to their school. It executes an insight into the meanings and practices of the students about PT and school learning and explored certain practices like, students' and their parents' rush for securing higher rank in school examination, strong motivation to accumulate human capital for securing advantageous position in higher education and profession in the future, school teachers' inefficiency or (un)intentional indifference to the process of teaching at school, private tutors' expectations for earning more perceiving tuition as a business strategy, contemporary system of evaluation and student-teacher ratio as the loci to deal with the issue. The significance of the study lies into grasping the ideas and rationales of the contemporary youth and their culture and contributing to the policies of contemporary education system.

Keywords: Students, School Teachers, Private Tutors, Academic Performance, Ethnography, Culture

* Doctoral Student, Department of Anthropology, University of Calcutta

Introduction

The interests of the ethnographer on the dimensions of academic practices among urban school students unearthed that in spite of witnessing rising popularity of PT throughout learning, the students of higher secondary standards reflected a striking inclination towards private tuitions (PT) to the extent that they were found to be reluctant about their school attendance. Focusing on four students of a girls' school located at urban setting of North Howrah, the study explored their experience to perceive school only as a formal institution to secure friends, academic degree and credentials to accumulate social and cultural capital (Bourdieu, 1997; Sullivan, 2002), but not the center for learning. The decision of the parents for letting their children to depend on private tutors, the eventual submission of the students to that, the growing indifference of the school teachers to classroom teaching which would be considered secondary by the students and finally the effort of the aspirant private tutors to sustain their control on the success of the school going students lead to the reified practice of dependence on PT.

The present endeavor is an attempt to explore and grasp the meaning, action and experience of the students of twelfth standard towards their orientation about learning practices at school, the significance of attaining PT and its consequences in academic practices. The study will significantly reflect the role of agencies (e.g. students, caretakers, etc.) in shifting the traditional responsibility of formal institution from providing education as per the curriculum to acting as the mere means to provide the academic credentials in terms of the choices and decisions of the participants.

A Brief Review of Previous Researches

Private tuition (PT) is a “non-free tutoring in academic subjects provided by the private sector in addition to the formal educational system, is a growing industry.....” (Choi, 2010). Theoretically and popularly the phenomenon is known as ‘shadow education’ (Bray, 2003; Stevenson and Baker, 1992) which implies that this industry never stands as self-sufficient educational activity apart from formal schooling, rather it is only an informal complementary of formal institution (Lee, 2013). Obtaining an important area in education over last two decades (Dang and Rogers, 2008), private tuition has been increased to a great extent and pervaded all the socio-economic strata of both developing and developed countries of the world, found more prominently in many

Asian countries along with in Africa, Europe, Korea and North America (Kim, 2007; Bray, 1999; 2003; 2005).

Drawing primarily the attention of social, economic and pedagogical domains, the conversations on PT provides principally two routes to discuss: firstly, the significance of short-term PT lies in preparing the school students for the entrance examination, i.e., securing higher score on the scholastic achievement tests, with the intention to increase the productivity of students in the labor market (Thurow, 1975) and secondly, the long-term PT is practiced to improve extra-curricular skills like, art, music, dance, gym, English and so on to accumulate human capital (Kim, 2007). Bray (1999, 2003) defined PT as a 'very complex phenomena' and stressed on its three elementary features: (1) *Academicness*: tutoring is concerned with the private teaching of the academic subjects (e.g. languages and mathematics) taught in schools, (2) *Privateness*: it is motivated by private tutors to gain profit, and (3) *Supplementation*: it is supplemental to mainstream schooling and is supplied during extra school hours. Relying on those three bases of PT demonstrated by Bray, Dang and Rogers defined private tutoring as ".....*fee-based* tutoring provided by *private* entrepreneurs and individuals for profit-making purposes, which provides *supplementary* instruction to children in *academic* subjects that they study in the formal primary and secondary education system" (Lee, 2013). Similarly Kwok Lai-yin (2004) highlighted on its three necessary features: (1) academic orientation, (2) monetary transfer (from tutees or their parents /guardians to tutors), and (3) tutoring content or mastery of some cognitive skills being in line with tutees' day-time schooling. Powell (1997), explained private tutoring as the assistance of formal schooling provided by the non-professionals to help the students "...to attain grade-level proficiency in basic skills and, as appropriate, learn more advanced skills." The role of tutoring is thus to assist in practicing homework, providing instruction and fostering good study habits. Heyneman (2011) described three functions of PT such as, enrichment, remediation and preparation for examination.

Following Powell (1997), tutoring is more frequent in higher education to encourage learning and to prevent the dropout of the vulnerable students. Tutoring is considered more beneficial for children from disadvantaged socioeconomic groups as well. On the other hand, from the publication of Yiu (1996) it was explored that the PT is very useful to bring desired success of

the educationally stronger students at school. From the recorded document (by Cohen in 1982, in the article of Powell, 1997) Powell showed that the students having private tutors performed well in examination and expressed more positive attitudes toward the subjects than their peers, with no private tutors. According to him, along with schooling practice of learning under private tutors is moderately effective to improve academic achievement and helps to gain a better understanding of the subjects. Consequently Choi (2010) explored that PT generated a positive effect on educational outcomes of the Korean students but it negatively affected the total efficiency of the Korean education system. The researches of Kim (2007) and Bray (1999, 2003, and 2005) witnessed that the practice of private tuition (PT) impedes upon the formal education system as well. Practicing such dependency on PT tend to promote negative attitudes to school attendance and thus significance of school decreases significantly specially in two months of before the school year finally ends (Hussein, 1987). Further, Hussein (1987) explained that, the absenteeism and reluctance of the majority severely damage the classroom environment and harms the interested few present in the class. In addition, the class teachers usually experience great disparity between the tutored and non-tutored students that the usual academic discussion becomes interrupted (De Silva, 1994; Bray, 2003).

However, Kwok (2004) illustrated types of PT from the cases of Hong Kong that tutoring may be individual, group (2-8 tutees per group) and mass (more than 8 tutees in a class). Bray (2003) found out various ways to provide tuitions (that other than direct teaching, it may be conducted through telephone, mail or e-chat) by various agents like, the mainstream teacher him/her-self or by others with an intention to avoid corruption. As an extension, the thinking of Biswal (1999) followed a game theoretical framework should consider in explaining the issues of PT that it is somewhat related to corruption (Bray, 2003) in developing countries where public school teachers show monopolistic power to force consumption of PT in order to compensate for their low salaries (Foondun, 2002; Shafiq, 2002; EFA Global Monitoring Report 2005, 2004). Accordingly Bray (2003) unearthed another negative impact of PT that, some school teachers deny organized and serious teaching the syllabus at formal classroom but takes the PT so seriously that the students are served very systematically to secure better performance in examination. After the study on the issue of PT at Hong Kong, Tseng (1998) reported the version of a school teacher during providing private tuition that, "I care about my performance in the tuition centre because I regard students as customers, not like in the formal school" (p. 59-60),

and the resulting ignorance of school teachers at school generates rely on PT by the students. Zeng (1999) observed that some states like, Japan, the Republic of Korea and Taiwan practice the process of PT like education industry – being assorted by a principal, assessment, competition, cost-benefit and cost-efficiency.

It is noteworthy that not only the private tutor treats the students as customer but the parents solely desire to consume expertized tutors implementing economic and social capital (Bourdieu: 1977, 1997). Highlighting the consumerist behavior of the parents, Kim's (2007) observation on the negative effects of PT is very significant in enhancing great educational disparities among students from different income brackets that, child from higher socio-economic group generally receives more supplementary tuitions than does a child from low economic group (Bray, 2003; Stevenson and Baker, 1992; Foondun, 2002; Montgomery et al., 2000; and Yi, 2002). Most important is that, thus the choices and promotion of economic capital enhances the marked economic stratification in future (Budiene, 2006).

Overall, even being an informally organized supplementary institution, the fundamental reasons behind the proliferation of PT are:

(1) Organizational factor of formal education:

- a. Deprived quality of formal schooling is one of the main causes in developing countries (Choi, 2010), as witnessed from the study on Korea (Kim, 2005).
- b. Teacher absenteeism (EFA Global Monitoring Report 2005, 2004) and Poor teaching performance of mainstream teachers also provokes increasing of PT (Bray, 2005).
- c. The structure and nature of the educational system including the system of evaluation influence the decision of hiring PT services (Choi, 2010), specially in Asia where the system of teaching and learning became totally examination based since years (Mariya, 2012). Kwok Lai-yin (2004) sensed private tutoring as a by-product of 'examination-oriented learning or examination-driven school curricula'.
- d. Lack of individual attention in classroom- general classroom inspires a 'learning community' (Kumaravadivelu, 1999) having specific rules and regulations to provide common learning, for which particular students often suffer from "...not understanding the lessons taught in the classroom; not getting individual attention...." Mariya (2012).

- e. Poor infrastructure (particularly classroom environment) of the formal institution hardly supports to be regular in school and attentive in learning (Mariya, 2012), finally provokes to depend on PT.

(2) Educational factor- urge for accumulation of good score in examination to achieve beneficial space in labour market (Piore and Doeringer, 1971; Budiene, 2006; Choi, 2010). Russell (2002) thus identified PT as “almost unnoticed, a revolution has taken place in state education” (p.10), becoming more important factor in a child’s performance.

(3) Cultural factor (as found among the Societies with Confucian roots) of explosion of PT is to treat the education as tool for personal development and as the main mechanism of social mobility (Bray and Kwok, 2003; Choi, 2010).

(4) Economic factor- where the parents from economically sound background take PT as an investment to gain well salaried job (Budiene, 2006; Choi, 2010). On contrary, to earn additional income to compensate low salary, school teachers often show inclination to practice private tuition (Foondun, 2002).

(5) Educational status of parents- Chew and Leong (1995) explored that higher demand for tuitions in urban area is associated with several socio-economic factors like, higher educational status of parents. The resulting expectation promotes high level of competition which provokes the urge for having tuitions among students, which further becomes possible and supplemented by their economically sound background in respect to rural realm. That is why private tutoring is more frequent in urban sector than the same in rural as reflected by numerous earlier works (Bray, 2003).

(6) Influence of other consumers- Neoclassical consumer theory concentrated on the parents’ demand for PT that influenced not only their own preferences for formal education and PT, but also affected those of other parents (Gintis, 1974; Manski, 2000). In this context Yang’s (2004) critical postulation was valuable that parents’ demand for PT cannot be explained by traditional economic decision making theory. Because generally most of the parents do not have objective and empirical information on the effectiveness of PT, but as economic agents, they attempt to broaden the scope of probable beneficial outcomes of PT through their own experience or by using information from other parents’ decision making to govern their decisions.

Certainly India is not an exception from executing such an issue. In India the fact of “culture of dependency” has been reported by Yasmeen (1999) that, most of the students depend on private tutors for ‘everything’ including homework and exam tips, the consequences of which appear problematic to the school teachers to retain the attention of the students. Like other developing countries such as Cambodia, Vietnam, Korea etc., in India PT is exerted as a supplement to standard course curriculum, provided by professional private tutors or even sometimes by the formal school teachers (Kim, 2007; Bray, 2003) though as per the Right to Education Act 2009, the exercise of private tuition was totally forbidden by the school teachers of both of government and government aided schools. Alike other developing nations, the cases of India also represents the drastically increasing inclination of receiving PT specially before the entrance examination of ‘popular’ secondary school, which was labeled as “the mad race for a place in a ‘five star’ secondary school” by Foondun (1992) and before the terminal school examination (Hussein, 1987). And moreover the crises for individual caring assumed as the essential criterion of success in examination based learning causes blind dependency on PT from the students’ and parents’ perspectives in India.

As per the Pratiche Education Report of 2002, 80% of the school children in India have been reported to go in for private tuition in 2001 (Pratiche Education Report 2002, in SCERT, 2009). State Council of Educational Research & Training (SCERT), National Council of Educational Research & Training (NCERT), Pratiche Trust, Pratham Foundation etc. seriously took the issues of PT and its consequences on educational system in India. In 1986-87 and 1995-96, the studies on the rate of consumption of PT among the boys of secondary and higher secondary schools in West Bengal reported that in both the sessions, the state occupied the top most position in India. It was most noteworthy that the dependency on private tutors reported extremely high among the higher secondary students, though the studies of Lee (2013) evidenced that the students of primary and lower secondary standards display increasing demand of PT for their desired academic achievement. The same report also witnessed the findings of earlier works that the urban area showed incredibly high inclination to receive PT than the same in rural area. The exploration was true for both India and West Bengal (Source: NSS 42 and 52 rounds, in Kochar, 2001). According to SCERT (2009), causes of increasing interest to hire private tuition in India are: A) lack of educational guidance from family; B) to prepare assigned home tasks of schools; C) to communicate sophisticatedly with private tutors to ask frequent questions to solve their

difficulties; D) to acquire high marks in the examinations. Hajra & Thakkar explained the explosion of PT from economic point of view that, Encompassing comparatively larger and complicated education sector than that of the US, India attracts entrepreneurs and financiers in education sector since last 5-6 years resulting rapid expansion of private institutes like education industry, over the country (Hajra & Thakkar, 2011).

At this juncture, the present study intends to explore and understand the meanings, intentions and practices of those students (occupying the terminal position of school life), about PT and school learning. Their insights are significant to grasp the notion, choice and decision of the contemporary trends of academic practices in urban realm. And, the consequences of the study may contribute the nation in rethinking the policies of education system.

The Objectives

To satisfy the research problem it is necessary to: (a) categorize and understand the essential criteria of classroom and private tuition practices from the lenses of the students, (b) interpret the factors behind reliance on the private tutors rather than the school teachers, (c) grasp the impact of such practice of the students on the formal schooling, (d) contribute the participatory insights for the benefit of policy and action of education in India.

Methodology

Ethnographic strategy grounded on qualitative reasoning framed the essence of this article to grasp the meaning, beliefs, emotion, attitudes and actions of the participants towards 'school', 'school-teachers' and 'private tutors' from the insiders' perspectives and to provide an in-depth interpretation of the pupil's experiences.

Following the intention of the work, the researcher purposively concentrated on the students of XI and XII of a particular girls' school and their orientation to the private tuitions throughout almost one year (2010-11). To satisfy the problem, the researcher selected that school located at North Howrah, assumed to be more convenient since facilitating the accessibility and geographical proximity (Warren and Karner, 2010). For smooth communication and decoding the meaning and notion of the students attached to the concerned formal and informal establishments the from their point of view, it was significant – (i) to select such a school with

Bengali as the medium of instruction (since it was her mother tongue as well), and (ii) to select girl students (with the expectation to have similarities in emotional attachment concerned with gender, facilitating in embodiment of the 'self' of the researchers in the field).

Following several casual conversations (like, title-tattle), the investigator selected four girls (two from each standard) for in-depth interviews. The way of selecting the students were both voluntary and purposive. Snow ball sampling was used to reach and interrogate the parents and the private tutors of the concerned students. The interviews were (semi-structured in nature) arranged at their residential settings and sometimes within the school settings. Verbal consents were assured by each of the participants under study. The study in the field continued for one year within the stated settings.

Recording of voice was significant to record the exact verbal expressions. For betterment of analysis, field notes were implemented to note down their gestures and body languages in one hand, and to record the expression, thinking and feelings of the researcher during and after each interview on the other. To cross-verify the statements of the participants within the field-settings, both the structured and non- structured observation became very crucial. Finally, the field diary in Malinowski's sense (Malinowski, 1967) and field data are being described in details at the end of the respective days of work. After the interview was over, the data was translated and sorted according to the objectives of the research. During translation the actual phrase, words, sentences and interpretation of the students remained unaltered to keep it natural or as it is. The collected data were analyzed and interpreted following ethnographic approach and methods.

The Findings

"I like to attend school....but I can't.....(you) know better!...There is huge pressure of private tutors"..... expressed Aliva, a student of XI standard of the conducted school. Contextually she justified, "daily at school!! Oh!!! No way! ...it is quite impossible you know..!! I visit school hardly once in a week Attending school daily after managing the private tuitions at both before and after school hours....!!!! Sooooo hectic it is." She takes tuitions on six subjects from six different tutors of different centers. She continued, *".....to do well in examinations it is fundamental to take tuition of each subject from each specialized teachers. Otherwise how I will compete with others,specially how I will acquire good marks in higher secondary exam on*

which the selection of college and subject of getting honors is solely depended?.....you know..... Dependency only on school is never sufficient today". Responses of Aishee, Ria and Saona echoed Aliva. Being the students of XI and XII they are very serious about their coaching centers and regularly attend there. Only for the practical classes they attend school once in a week and depend only on the private tutors for preparing the total theoretical portion of their curriculum. In case when Aliva remained present at class, she used to practice the lessons provided in PT within the class time and on off periods as well or, she used to spend time with friends or mobile phone. Categorization of the conversations on the issues of PT has been framed out under the following themes for better understanding the stories of the participants.

Private Tuition as a Commodity

From the beginning of upper secondary session only Ria became introduced to private tuition by her mother and from VII standard Aliva and Saona, and from VIII Aishee entered into the process initiated by their mothers as well. Following the field exploration the decision of their mothers' privileged up to VIII standard and since IX they asked to take information of good tutors from friend circle and from seniors. In V and VI they had one tutor for all subjects. Since from VII none allowed to take care of all subjects, the educationally and/or economically sound parents (it was true for Aishee) felt specialized PT for their child so they provided at least three tutors (one for science, one for arts group and one for Mathematics or English) up to X standard. Contrarily the educationally and/or economically weak parents (in case of Ria, Saona and Aliva) habitually depended on only two tutors from VIII to X.

Just after completion of the Madhyamik examination, according to the choice to take 'science' as the stream for H.S level Aliva took initiation to search the 'best tutors' from the conveniences. Since she found her parents inefficient (though the mother was an arts graduate and the father leaved his study in H.S. level), she begged of her cousin brother (an under-graduate student of physics) for the ideas that what would be beneficial in this regard. Then keeping his experience in mind she assumed it better to take suggestions of the former tutors at first, and then seniors of the school as she would go through almost 'the same experience as they had'. Thus as per her decision she admitted to three 'popular' tutors to take preparation of physics, chemistry and mathematics as early as possible. A tutor gained popularity by securing goodwill in teaching in convincing way, having friendly interaction with the students, maintaining such a batch having

the access to get one to one attention during teaching associated with reasonable fees, regulating systematized classes and tests following the syllabus and the pattern of questions common to the recent examinations, providing opportunity to practice suitable practical curriculum, and finally, providing promising suggestions before final exams; and thus throughout years he/she became 'best' among the tutors. Another way to gain popularity of tutors was to maintain good rapport with the school teachers. Then followed by the mark sheet of Madhyamik she attended other three tutors in the same way to make easy the lessons of biology, Bengali and English. Following the guideline of the seniors and others, she became convinced to attend each tuition class seriously and to bunk the school. And, over time she gradually realized that it was hardly possible to maintain time for school, tuitions and practicing regularly. As she aimed to have high score in exams and found attending school equated with '*totally useless*' and '*wastage of time*' she decided to bunk school and follow only the guideline of tutors.

The stories of Aishee, Ria and Saona of selecting the tutors sounded almost same or similar though aishee was a student of commerce, Ria was from arts, and Saona was in science stream. Among them, the tutors were selected by her mother after long term conversation with her, seniors and her previous tutors of secondary level. But following the opinion of her friends Aishee changed her tutor of mathematics just after the examination of XI as he became failed to rise her score. As one of the tutors teach only two girls at a time and took minute care of the concerned subject, her mother had to spend almost Rs. 3500 per month as tuition fee, quite expensive than other parents who generally paid approximately Rs. 2000-2200 per month since their children used to take tuition within a group of at least 10-15 students.

Except two among them rests of the private tutors were professional tutors. But Ria took supplementary Bengali classes from that person who was teacher of a local school by profession. Beyond school hours she practiced PT for – (1) she enjoyed teaching, and (2) it was highly profitable not laborious at all (as she used to deal with the same subject matter both in class and coaching center).

The Choices of the Students

Since V standard Ria used to take the help of PT as there was none at the home to take care of her in this matter, otherwise the rests were guided by their mother up to VI. Aliva and Saona got introduced with PT in class VII when their mothers – (1) found themselves incomplete to provide proper guidance, and (2) following others' experiences they decided to make the base strong of the most fundamental subjects like, English, mathematics and science, for which PT became 'the necessity'. From VIII standard, Aishee was brought in front of tutor not due to her mother's inefficiency but with the intention to make the subjects as '*investment of future*'. Although they grew up within the circumstance of relying on PT but the regulation of strict discipline and examination by school authority hold on the total control of the students that they left no ways other than follow the normative system of learning of the school, for which they further were somewhat compelled to attend school regularly except grounded reasons and were forced to conform the learning practice as was provided by teachers.

With the succession of classes to higher secondary level all became too aware about their career and learned to depend only on PT in spite of school. The teachers were quite familiar about such tendency of students since years and they were habituated to deal the class containing few students. But since last five to six years the students became quite arrogant and did not hesitate to show '*vague kindnesses*' to the teachers. Some of the teachers provoked them to depend on PT as well. The factors responsible for ignoring the teachers and depending on tutors are:

1. Sensing to be Grown Up and Withdrawing of Strictness

After crossing the first board examination the teachers, parents and obviously the students found themselves to be grown up and relished their seniority in the school. The authority also pulled out the strictness (of attending school every day) from them to feel them relax to deal with lessons through times. But influenced by other agencies they misinterpreted the fact as it was authentic to feel them liberal to off the classes of school according to their wills.

2. Attitudes of the Caretakers of the Students Towards Educational Settings

Their private tutors influenced them to escape school with the promise that they will provide better practice for Board Examination. Being convinced by the tutors, the parents motivated them to bunk the school to take preparation at home instead of wasting time at school. Simultaneously sensing the inclination of the students the teachers used to deal with them so casually and taught subject very superficially that, *“they believe only the tutors just as ‘God’ and follow their guideline in spite of delivering wonderful teaching. All the endeavor of school teachers will be ruined. We are none to them. Then why I waste my energy and time for them!!!”* which led the serious students frustrated about school. Finally the consequences negatively affected the students from financially weak family like Ria, Saona and Aliva who became indirectly forced to rely on PT finding the teachers *‘hopeless’*.

3. Patterns of Interaction with ‘Tutors’ and ‘Teachers’

All the students under study, customarily recognized the school teachers as ‘teacher’ with whom they learned from the earlier classes (through tradition) to maintain formal communication. Hence the majority of them afraid and hesitate to present queries even after having difficulties in learning. The matter of Pupil-Teacher Ratio (PTR) in the classroom and limited duration of period were responsible as well to hinder to take individual care and to make easy interaction. Throughout V – X standards PTR was 55-58, in XI-Arts it became 35, XI-Commerce it was 30 and in XI-Science it was 32. On contrary, the private tutors usually entertained 10-15 students in each batch. He/she took care of more or less each student and was very frank in attitude. The proximity and assurance made him/her more convincing than the school teachers and thus they appeared as ‘tutor’, with whom the students found themselves emotionally attached.

4. Learning Practices at School and Tuition Centers

Throughout the school life they experienced, the teachers usually discussed the substance of the topic, highlighted the key terms and areas. Very few of them discussed the systematic style of writing questions. Limited time of periods, high PTR, and the rush and tremendous pressure of unit test examination enforce the teachers to provide only the guideline, sample and some typical exercise of lessons at class, and the rests are suggested to practice at home. The lectures of only four (English, Mathematics, Geography and Life Science) among the teachers were so beautiful, systematic and attractive that to prepare the subject matter they might rely merely on the school. But due to section division majority of the student were unfortunate to miss the classes of those teachers.

On the other hand, in PT, the tutor introduced the theme at first, then explained the subject matter as per the levels of individual merit, provided structured question with answers, took exams for evaluation, and provided practical classes. Moreover students were free to ask the solution of the subjective problems and were obliged to prepare the lessons regularly from the fear of being scolded by the tutors. In sum, PT was there to minimize the crises of preparing for final exams and as obvious there was none lacking the facility.

Finally, all the subjective decisions to remain absent in school made collective expression that when a teacher introduced a lesson on Monday with two or three students, Tuesday she found other two or three students for whom she repeat the previous lecture. On Wednesday she found none in the class and on Thursday she met three of four students who remained absent on earlier. Then on the fifth day when a student revisited school for second time in the week she discovered that the teacher could not cross the boundary of the first day of the week in comparison to the PT where the tutor already started the next topic. Then she realized and identified the teachers as “.....*bogus, casual, non-professional and very inefficient on theoretical knowledge*”. Thus the tutor became the idol to guide education and to collect great marks which was “*indispensable for winning the rat race*”.

5. To Get Proximity with the Teachers

Individual experience made the interested students with average academic performances like, Aishee and Aliva feel that it was necessary to achieve 'good marks' to come 'closer' of their favorable teachers, to raise voice to declare own preferences, and to be praised like the toppers. So they inclined to PT to reinforce the skill to secure better marks in results as to secure convincing position in the classroom.

6. Promising Improvement in result

Aishee and Aliva conformed desired academic performances with the supplementation of PT. Ria and Saona were 'below average' students but they gained confidence to promote in upper classes after being treated by their tutors. But as all the students including the toppers received PT they never became front in comparison.

7. Private tuition and friendship

The absence of 'close friends' was another indirect but prominent reason of being detached with school and to restrict to grow minimum interest to it. They remained absent following the conspiracy over phone and being pressurized by authority they visited school for practical classes only after confirming the presence of friends in class. Another significant reason to drop the attraction of school was that, the old friends (for whom she used to feel attraction of school in junior classes) became separated and new friendship created from XI, who was also available at same coaching centers where she attended.

The resulting rationale made them feel the school was very reliable ground to chat and fun, to learn with enjoyment and to spend time with friends, so they took it casually and enjoyed the school life up to class X; and they found coaching centers as the machines to grow educational productivity for which they were enough serious about PT throughout former classes. Becoming at the terminal position of school their careerist mind discovered school as just the formal establishment to achieve credentials, but was so incompetent in terms of academic practices.

Discussion and Conclusion

The interests of present ethnography on the contemporary academic practices in urban school reflect a unique experience of explosion of informal educational construction (PT) promoted by the participants of the formal educational institution. It interprets the picture that how the motivations of the caretakers (parents, teachers and tutors), system of examination and urges for collect high marks in exams to capitalize the 'good' performance in maximizing the life chances gradually leads the informal sector of education privileged. The study unearths the power of the rational choices and practices of the participants and their caretaking agents in shifting the expression and the dominancy of the institutions. The phenomenon of gaining high popularity of PT and losing the glory of school can be explained as -

1. Present strategy of Government to provide examination-based school curriculum somewhat responsible to provoke to take PT increasingly.
2. The data identified the determinants for private tutoring that are- accessibility, affordability and insufficiency, peer group pressure, influence of parents on other parents, crises for securing high score in respect of their present academic status to secure the position to get preferable honors subject in popular college, the influence of tradition to have private tuition from specific centers. Accessibility referred to the availability and transportability of PT centers. Affordability concerned about the Socio-economic capabilities to hire tutoring. Insufficiency spotlights the socio-cultural sense that the dissatisfaction of basic and/or extra learning needs instigated from curriculum of the schools and lack of free academic guidance within tutees' family members, school teachers, peers and self-learning. Deficiency and inefficiency of suitable person to help the child in preparation of learning for examination in urban nuclear family setting provokes to accommodate PT. This problem becomes more serious, among the first generation learners and the disadvantaged classes in rural or semi urban setting. Hence, Private classes become necessity for the students to cope with the curriculum of school.
3. The students incline to PT in from V to X standards not only for the incompetence of the school teachers, rather for better results and academic guidance. The degree of private tuition concurrently increases with students' succession from upper primary to the secondary level. And finally, the students of higher secondary (XI, XII) are instructed by

their private tutors and parents, and experience the insufficient circumstances of learning at school, then consciously judge the decision to depend only on PT rather than school.

4. Culturally constructed meaning promotes some subjects (such as, mathematics, English and the rest science based subjects) as most fundamental, popular and tough to grasp, and moreover labels them as basic investment of skill to secure high scaled job. Thus the caretakers (parents, school teachers and private teachers as well) eagerly make the students understand the significance and fear of those typical subjects and prompt to take PT seriously.
5. As per the proposition of Right to Education Act 2010, the STR in the classroom should not exit 40:1 (WBSSE, 2010) as to explore student's inclination and merit level through one to one interaction and to provide individual attention and teach accordingly. But the reality represents having 55-60:1 STR in each class, the majority of the students of class V to X suffer the crises of individual attention and caring which regarded as essential for both the recent child and examination based learning. Often some students with poor academic performances afraid to ask questions to their class teachers due to the panic of being labeled. But they can easily communicate with their private tutors. Such easy communication provides the tutor the sense of individual merit level, so that the Students enjoy the opportunity to be guided accordingly with easy procedure than that of school teacher, helps them to acquire comparatively high marks in the examinations.
6. Overlooking the rules of ceasing the private tuition practicing professionally by the teachers of the government and government aided school under the section 28 (189-SE (Law)/S/1A-01/09 dated. 14.02.2011) of Right to Education Act 2010, some of the school teachers openly retain the practice.

Under such great meritocratic and credential pressure, all the tutees and their parents consider private tuition as a typical form of educational investment for securing social mobility. Urge to accumulate high score in examination triggers the students, specially their parents to consume specialized private tutors for each subject. The data unearths that the students with high parents' exclusively mothers' educational qualifications tend to show greater demand for consuming tutors than those with low qualifications. Often the ambitious and economically sound consumers commodify the skilled tutors in terms of high expenses which create the further instance for the fresher of next session. Then it becomes highly problematic to the financially

poor consumers to afford those highly efficient and expensive private tutors for each subject for their child where starting scale of PTs is beyond the calculation of monthly expenditure. Yet such parents attempt to accumulate the maximum fees for other affordable tutors assumed cheaper, minimizing some of their supplementary demands of life. So other than having influential social network of the parents or relatives, only the parents from high economic group provides better PT in exchange of high fees for securing high score in examination which further lead the high salaried income for their child. Such the silent intervention of the dominance of private tuition negatively affects and effects the commitment of the Indian Constitution for 'free education'. Thus in spite of being a 'hidden' (Kwok, 2004) establishment PT is very significant to promote human capital and thus enhancing educational inequality and social inequity issues.

The conversations with the participants helped the present research to find out a few alternative opinions that might help to future policy making and action, are as follows-

- School should initiate immediate measures that include students' perspectives and active participation of the participants. Alternatives may include steps encouraging the regular attender with prize, enhancing the attraction of practical works for better understanding, arranging extra classes by guest delegates to satisfy extra academic needs etc.
- School should provide quality education.
- There must be at least one suitable figure from families to resolve the problems in school education, and extra learning.
- Policy should be strict to ban providing PT by school teachers to concentrate only on quality teaching at school.
- Student-teacher ratio should be restricted as per rule to provide individual attention and caring through one to one interaction.
- It may be a significant step if School authority launches scheduled class for counseling in crises.
- The parents should be aware about the glory of attending school to learn new and alternative meaning through interactions and thus to positively influence their child to attend school.

- In emergency, the labeled school teachers may be threatened or rewarded by enjoying salary as per their teaching performances as the cases explored that, some teachers directly declare to take suggestion of PT to bunk the schedule class at school.
- At least the parents of the student should be efficient to guide the homework and other academic necessities.

References

- Biswal, B.P. (1999). Private Tutoring and Public Corruption: A Cost-Effective Education System for Developing Countries. *The Developing Economies*, 37(2), 222-240.
- Bourdieu, P. (1977). *Reproduction in Education, Society and Culture*. London: Sage.
- Bourdieu, P. (1997). The Forms of Capital. In A. H. Halsey, H. Lauder, P. Brown, & A. Stuart -Wells (Eds.), *Education: Culture, Economy and Society* (pp.46-58). Oxford & New York: Oxford University Press.
- Bray, M. (1999). The Shadow Education System: Private Tutoring and its Implication for Planners. *Fundamentals of Educational Planning No 61*. Paris: UNESCO, International Institute for Educational Planning (IIEP).
- Bray, M., and Kwok, P. (2003): *Demand for private supplementary tutoring: conceptual considerations, and socio-economic patterns in Hong Kong*. *Economics of Education Review*, 22, 611-620.
- Card, J. (2005): "Life and death exams in South Korea", *Asian Times*, 30 Nov.
- Bray, Mark (2003), *Adverse Effects of Private Supplementary Tutoring- Dimensions, Implications And Government Responses*, international institute of educational planning, www.unesco.org/iiep
- Bray, M. (2005). Private Supplementary Tutoring; Comparative Perspectives on Patterns and Implication. *Oxford International Conference on Education and development. 'Learning and Livelihood'*, 13-15th September, 2005.
- Budiene, Virginija. (2006). Private Tutoring: Educating Society or Driving Social Stratification? In: *Education in a Hidden Marketplace: Monitoring Of Private Tutoring: Overview and Country Reports*. Education Support Program of The Open Society Institute, Network Of Education Policy Centers. Open Society Institute.

- Chew, S.B.; Leong, Y.C. (Eds.). (1995). *Private Tutoring in Malaysia and Sri Lanka: a comparative study*. Kuala Lumpur: Department of Social Foundations in Education, University Of Malay. (Project Directors: T. Marimuthu And W.A. De Silva)
- Choi, Álvaro. (2010). Analysis of Private Tutoring Decisions in Korea: A Game Theory Approach. *Regional and Sectoral Economic Studies*. Vol. 10-3.
- Dang, H. & Rogers, F. H. (2008). *How to Interpret the Growing Phenomenon of Private Tutoring: Human Capital Deepening, Inequality Increasing, or Waste of Resources?* (World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 4530). Retrieved from <http://ssrn.com/abstract=1098628>
- Education for All: The Quality Imperative. (2005). EFA Global Monitoring Report. United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization. France. Published in 2004.
- Foondun, A.R. (1992). *Private tuition in Mauritius: The mad race for a place in a 'five star' secondary school*. Paris: IIEP-UNESCO. (Monograph No. 8, 'Increasing and improving the quality of basic education' series.)
- Gintis, H. (1974). Welfare Criteria with Endogenous Preferences: The Economics of Education. *International Economic Review*, 15(2), 415-430.
- Hajra, S. & Thakkar, A. (2011). *US\$45bn private education opportunity: Everyone wants a slice*. Indian Education. Anand Rathi Research. Education Sector Report).
- Heyneman, S.P. (2011). Private tutoring and social cohesion. *Peabody journal of education*, 86(2), 183-188.
- Hussein, M.G.A. (1987). Private tutoring: a hidden educational problem. In: *Educational Studies in Mathematics*. 18 (1), pp.91-96.
- Kim, T. (2005): "Shadow education: school quality and demand for private tutoring in Korea", *Interfaces for Advanced Economic Analysis Discussion Paper*, 55.
- Kim, Ji-Ha (2007), *A Game Theoretical Approach to Private Tutoring in South Korea*, Department of Education, Yonsei University, South Korea.
- Kochar, A. (2001). Emerging Challenges for Indian Education Policy. Paper presented at the Center for Research on Economic Development and Policy Reform Conference on Indian Economic Prospects: Advancing Policy Reform. Working Paper No. 97. Stanford University.

- Kwok Lai-yin, Percy. (2004). Emergence of Demand for Private Supplementary Tutoring in Hong Kong: Argument, Indicators and Implications. *Hong Kong Teachers' Centre Journal*. Vol. 3. Hong Kong Teachers' Centre.
- Lee, J. Y. (2013). *Private Tutoring and Its Impact on Students' Academic Achievement, Formal Schooling, and Educational Inequality in Korea*. Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy under the Executive Committee of the Graduate School of Arts and Sciences. Columbia University.
- Malinowski Bronislaw, 1967, *A Diary in the Strict Sense of the Term*, Routledge and Kegan Paul Ltd., Great Britain.
- Manski, C. F. (2000). Economic Analysis of Social Interactions. *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, 14(2), 115-136.
- Mariya, M. (2012). *'I don't learn at school, so I take tuition': An ethnographic study of classroom practices and private tuition settings in the Maldives*. (A dissertation presented in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor in Philosophy in Second Language Teaching, at Massey University, Palmerston North, New Zealand.)
- Mauritius. Government of. (1994). *Use and abuse of private tuition*. Port Louis: Ministry of Education.
- Montgomery, M.R.; Agyeman, D.K.; Aglobitse, P.B.; Heiland, F. (2000). *New elements of the cost of children: supplementary schooling in Ghana*. New York: the population council.
- Piore, M.J., and Doeringer, P.B. (1971): *Internal labor markets and manpower analysis*. Heath Lexington Books, Lexington, MA.
- Powell, M. Anne (1997), *Academic Tutoring and Mentoring: A literature Review*, California Research Bureau, California State Library, CRB-97-01.
- Russell, J. (2002). The secret lessons. In: *New Statement*, 8 April, 10-13.
- Shafiq, M.N. (2002). *The economic burden of private tutoring expenses on households in developing countries: the case of Bangladesh*. (Paper presented at the Annual Conference of the Comparative and International Education Society, Orlando, Florida).
- State Council Of Educational Research And Training (W.B), Department of School Education, Govt. of West Bengal, *Implications of Private Tuition in West Bengal, 2009* (Kolkata).

- Stevenson, D.L.; Baker, D.P. (1992). Shadow education and allocation in formal schooling: transition to university in Japan. In: *American journal of sociology*, 97 (6). 1639-1657.
- Sullivan, Alice. (2002). Bourdieu and Education: How Useful is Bourdieu's Theory for Researchers? *The Netherlands' Journal of Social Sciences*. Volume 38.no. 2.
- The Gazette of India (2010). *The Right of Children to Free and Compulsory Education Act 2009*. Govt. of India. New Delhi: Ministry of Human Resource Development (MHRD).
- Thurow, L. C. (1975). *Generating Inequality: Mechanism of Distribution in the U.S. Economy*. New York: Basic Books.
- Tseng, J.L.C. (1998). *Private supplementary tutoring at the senior secondary level in Taiwan and Hong Kong*. (M. Ed. Dissertation, The University of Hong Kong).
- Warren, Carol A. B., and Karner, T. X., 2010, *Discovering Qualitative Methods, Field Research, Interviews and Analysis*, 2nd ed., Oxford University Press, Oxford, New York.
- West Bengal Board of Secondary education. Circular No. S/02. Dated 12th January, 2010 (accessed on 06.07.14 at 08.42 AM).
- Yasmeen, S. (1999). The spreading private tuitions epidemic. In: *School: Journal of Educational Excellence [India]*. May. Pp.21-25.
- Yang, S. (2001). *Tutoring policy change and reflection on the roles of public and private education*. Seoul: Korean Education Development Institute. [In Korean]
- Yi, P. (2002). *Household spending on private tutoring in South Korea*. (Paper presented at the Annual Conference of the Comparative and International Education Society, Orlando, Florida).
- Yiu, J.M.T. (1996). *A study of curriculum change in Hong Kong: the case of advanced level economics*. (M. Ed. Dissertation, The University of Hong Kong).
- Zeng, K. (1999). *Dragon gate: competitive examinations and their consequences*. London: Cassell.